



Bertelsmann Stiftung, Migration Policy Institute (eds.)

Talent, Competitiveness and Migration

The Transatlantic Council on Migration

Bertelsmann Stiftung, Migration Policy Institute (eds.)

Talent, Competitiveness and Migration

The Transatlantic Council on Migration

| **Verlag BertelsmannStiftung**

Bibliographic information published by the Deutsche Nationalbibliothek

The Deutsche Nationalbibliothek lists this publication in the Deutsche Nationalbibliografie; detailed bibliographic data is available on the Internet at <http://dnb.d-nb.de>.

© 2010 *eBook edition (PDF)*

2. Auflage 2010

© 2009 Verlag Bertelsmann Stiftung, Gütersloh

Responsible: Dr. Christal Morehouse

Copy editor: Michelle Mittelstadt

Production editor: Christiane Raffel

Cover design: Nadine Humann

Cover illustration: Photo Disc/Doug Menuetz

Typesetting and Printing: Hans Kock Buch- und Offsetdruck GmbH, Bielefeld

ISBN 978-3-86793-269-1

www.bertelsmann-stiftung.org/publications

Contents

Foreword	7
<i>Demetrios G. Papademetriou, Gunter Thielen</i>	
 Part I: The Transatlantic Council on Migration	13
Introduction:	
The Aims of the Transatlantic Council on Migration	15
<i>Transatlantic Council on Migration</i>	
Council Statement: Responding Competitively to the New Mobility of the 21st Century	22
<i>Demetrios G. Papademetriou, Annette Heuser</i>	
 Part II: Piecing together the Global Demographic Puzzle	31
Emerging Demographic Trends in Asia and the Pacific:	
The Implications for International Migration	33
<i>Graeme Hugo</i>	
The Demography of China and India:	
Effect on Migration to High-Income Countries through 2030 ...	100
<i>Michael J. White, Inku Subedi</i>	
Emerging Demographic Patterns across the Mediterranean and their Implications for Migration through 2030	129
<i>Philippe Fargues</i>	
Demographic and Human-Capital Trends in Eastern Europe and Sub-Saharan Africa	163
<i>Wolfgang Lutz, Warren Sanderson, Sergei Scherbov, Samir K.C.</i>	

Demographic Trends in Mexico: The Implications for Skilled Migration	193
<i>Elena Zúñiga, Miguel Molina</i>	
Part III: Competing for Talent	213
Talent in the 21st Century Economy	215
<i>Demetrios G. Papademetriou, Will Somerville, Hiroyuki Tanaka</i>	
Hybrid Immigrant-Selection Systems: The Next Generation of Economic Migration Schemes	267
<i>Demetrios G. Papademetriou, Will Somerville, Hiroyuki Tanaka</i>	
Soft, Scarce and Super Skills: Sourcing the Next Generation of Migrant Workers in Europe	337
<i>Elizabeth Collett, Fabian Zuleeg</i>	
The Growing Global Demand for Students as Skilled Migrants	362
<i>Lesleyanne Hawthorne</i>	
Part IV: Epilogue	399
Immigration and Competitiveness at a Time of Deepening Recession	401
<i>Demetrios G. Papademetriou</i>	
Part V: Discussion Summary	409
Second Meeting of the Transatlantic Council on Migration	411
<i>Transatlantic Council on Migration</i>	
Biographies of the Council Members and Staff	427
Overview of Council Meetings	447
Immigration and Integration Resources	449

Foreword

As the global economic crisis ripples across the financial, political and social landscape, it is leaving its mark on international migration. The recession, hailed as the worst since the Great Depression, is already having a marked impact on the scope and pace of international migration and its effects could deepen with the world economy expected to worsen beyond 2009.

Already, with unemployment rising sharply, many countries are considering tightening their immigration policies to protect jobs at home. And though the differing immigration flows—legal, humanitarian and illegal, among them—don't respond identically to economic disruptions, there are some observable trends.

Governments, businesses and individuals have all felt the damaging consequences of the global downturn, which has shaken confidence in established institutions. The crisis is driving some policymakers and analysts in Europe and North America to re-think their assumptions about labor migration.

Yet while policymakers consider restrictions on international labor migration as they face exceptionally strong popular and political pressures to protect jobs at home, they would do well to consider demographic realities.

In the coming decades the “push” factor impelling migrants to leave countries in the developing world is expected to grow stronger. As countries in Europe and North America age and decline in population, others will emerge with much higher levels of working-age people. Asia, for example, is expected to be home to half of the world's

15–34 year-old population by 2030. The predicted rapid rise in the size of highly educated populations in Asia and in parts of Africa will introduce new currents in the global flows of skilled labor migrants and students.

Economic competitiveness will become even more dependent on pooling talent in the future, triggering a race for talent. Governments from continents of immigrant destination such as North America, Europe and Australia will find themselves in greater competition to accumulate economically vital talent and to secure national standards of living. In the absence of international human capital, it will become increasingly difficult for countries in these parts of the world to remain leading centers of economic growth and innovation.

The global migration picture of the 21st century will be very different from that of the last one. This book offers insights into how governments can achieve a nuanced understanding of the forces that will form this century's migration flows. It can also help far-sighted policymakers formulate responses that allow them to go beyond the most urgent, near-term challenges that they face.

This volume examines the complex and contradictory challenges to immigration policy that governments face in the short- and mid-term. It is divided into four parts. Part One begins with an introduction, describing the structure, objectives, approach and aims of the Transatlantic Council on Migration. This is followed by the Council's Statement on Responding Competitively to the New Mobility of the 21st Century. The Statement contains the main deliberations and recommendations that emerged from the second meeting of the Transatlantic Council on Migration from November 19–21, 2008 in New York. Although the Statement reflects the deliberations of the Council, final responsibility for the contents rests with the authors.

Part Two analyzes global demographic change, especially in the first three decades of this century. It focuses on Asia and the Pacific as a region and then on China and India in particular. It also looks at Western Europe's main regions of immigrant origin: Mediterranean, Eastern Europe and sub-Saharan Africa. Finally it examines the United States' most important country of immigrant origin: Mexico.

Graeme Hugo begins Part Two with his chapter on “Emerging Demographic Trends in Asia and the Pacific: The Implications for International Migration.” In many ways, the 21st century is shaping up to be an Asian century as the region experiences a youth bulge and education levels rise. Although a large pool of potential migrants will emerge from the continent, the regional need for skilled international labor is likely to limit the outflow of large-scale migration, instead keeping significant migration flows within the continent.

The second chapter, entitled “The Demography of China and India: Effect on Migration to High-Income Countries through 2030,” was written by Michael J. White and Inku Subedi. It examines the key demographic drivers in China and India and explores how these may affect future immigration flows.

The third chapter is a work by Philippe Fargues entitled “Emerging Demographic Patterns across the Mediterranean and their Implications for Migration through 2030.” It explores the possible demographic match between the Middle East and Northern Africa (MENA) with Europe. It also looks at how changing fertility and education patterns might influence migration from the MENA region.

The fourth chapter entitled, “Demographic and Human-Capital Trends in Eastern Europe and Sub-Saharan Africa,” was co-authored by Wolfgang Lutz, Warren Sanderson, Sergei Scherbov and Samir K.C. It analyses demographic trends in two regions with opposing tendencies: rapid population growth and rapid population aging. It also addresses the challenges policymakers face to fit the needs of these regions with the human capital and resources they need to prosper.

The fifth chapter is the work of Elena Zúñiga and Miguel Molina. It is entitled “Demographic Trends in Mexico: The Implications for Skilled Migration.” Currently, Mexico’s population growth is slowing. By 2030, the size of its working-age population is expected to decrease. The chapter looks at the impact this demographic change could have on flows of highly skilled migrants, especially to the United States and what consequences this could have on Mexico’s labor market.

Part Three explores the characteristics and behavior of skilled migrants. It takes a three-fold approach. It probes how:

- governments regulate migration,
- businesses make decisions on international operations and labor recruitment, and
- individual immigrants make decisions to seek work or study abroad.

Chapter six, entitled “Talent in the 21st Century Economy,” was co-authored by Demetrios G. Papademetriou, Will Somerville and Hiro-yuki Tanaka. The chapter explores how to find, attract and develop international talent in the 21st century. It shows how three factors determine individuals’ choice of destination: opportunity, infrastructure and the presence of other talent.

Chapter seven was written by the same authors and is entitled “Hybrid Immigrant-Selection Systems: The Next Generation of Economic Migration Schemes.” The authors explore the different elements that make up governmental systems that select and admit skilled international labor and the varying importance policymakers place on those elements and why.

Chapter eight is entitled “Soft, Scarce and Super Skills: Sourcing the Next Generation of Migrant Workers in Europe.” It is the work of Elizabeth Collett and Fabian Zuleeg. This chapter breaks down the dichotomy between highly skilled and low-skilled labor. It points to flaws in the current thinking and selections systems for international labor migrants.

The final chapter in this Part is called “The Growing Global Demand for Students as Skilled Migrants” and was written by Lesley-anne Hawthorne. It examines the role of students in the international talent pool and what implications the flows of international students have on countries’ ability to recruit and maintain their national talent pools.

Part Four of this book is an Epilogue, written by Demetrios G. Papademetriou, suggesting that even in the midst of a persistent economic downturn policymakers would be wise to resist economic nationalism’s siren song of stopping immigration or discriminating against

immigrants already in our midst. International migration is neither the panacea nor the cause of so many societal ills, and the epilogue suggests an approach of caution.

Part Five of this book is a summary of the discussion at the Council's meeting in November 2008. It sets out for readers the key deliberations of the Council members and experts who attended the meeting. It is written in accordance with the Chatham House Rule and does not reveal the speakers' identities. The rule is intended to foster free and uninhibited discussion.

This volume contains the biographies of the Council Members, chapter authors, meeting guests and staff. It also contains a summary of Council-related migration and integration resources on the Web, as well as an overview of past and future Council meetings.

All chapters contained in this book are original contributions from leading academics and thinkers on international migration. They were commissioned to stimulate increased transatlantic debate and dialogue on issues of talent, competitiveness and migration. With this book, the Migration Policy Institute in Washington (DC) and its policy partners, the Bertelsmann Stiftung and the European Policy Centre, hope to spark advanced thinking about migration policies on both sides of the Atlantic.

Demetrios G. Papademetriou
Migration Policy Institute

Gunter Thielen
Bertelsmann Stiftung

Part I:

The Transatlantic Council on Migration

Introduction:

The Aims of the Transatlantic Council on Migration

Transatlantic Council on Migration

This book reflects the effort of the Transatlantic Council on Migration to understand and map how profound demographic change across the globe over the next few decades is likely to affect both the size and character of migration flows; and how governments in traditional immigrant-receiving countries can shape immigration policy to more nimbly and efficiently attract the human capital they need to remain competitive in a world increasingly attuned to the hunt for talent.

This volume is the second major product of the Council, and is based on the deliberations and research commissioned for the Council's meeting in November 2008 in New York. It joins the first Council book, *Delivering Citizenship*, which examined key aspects of the citizenship debate from a policy perspective. *Delivering Citizenship* incorporates the commissioned papers, Council conclusions and discussion summaries from the Council's first meeting, held in Bellagio, Italy in April 2008.

The Second Meeting of the Transatlantic Council on Migration

The Council convened in New York in November 2008 at a meeting hosted by the Greentree Foundation, focusing on the theme "Economic Competitiveness and International Migration." The papers commissioned for the meeting are presented in this book, and an abbreviated summary of the Council's discussion is included later in this book.

This introduction offers an overview of the Transatlantic Council on Migration: its mission, make-up, support and operation.

About the Transatlantic Council on Migration

The Council was launched in 2008 as a new initiative of the Migration Policy Institute (MPI) in Washington, DC. The Bertelsmann Stiftung and the European Policy Centre are the Council's policy partners. The Council is supported by the Carnegie Corporation of New York, the Ford Foundation, the Rockefeller Foundation, the Hellenic Migration Policy Institute (IMEPO) and the governments of the Netherlands and Norway. More information about the Council's membership, operations and publications can be found at: www.migrationpolicy.org/transatlantic.

The permanent Council members are: Giuliano Amato, former Prime Minister and Minister of the Interior in Italy; Xavier Becerra, Member of the US House of Representatives since 1992 and Vice Chairman of the House Democratic Caucus; Mel Cappe, President of the Institute of Research on Public Policy and formerly Canada's High Commissioner to the United Kingdom; Armin Laschet, Minister for Intergenerational Affairs, Family, Women and Integration in North Rhine-Westphalia, Germany, and a former parliamentarian of the European Union; Libe Rieber-Mohn, the State Secretary for integration, immigration and diversity matters in the Norwegian Department of Labor and Inclusion; Ana Palacio, Senior Vice President for International Affairs and Marketing for AREVA, and formerly parliamentarian of the European Union, Foreign Minister of Spain, and Senior Vice President and General Counsel of the World Bank; Trevor Phillips, Chairman of the UK Commission on Equality and Human Rights; Rita Süßmuth, former President (Speaker) of the German Bundestag (1988–1998) and twice leader of Germany's Independent Commissions on Immigration and on Integration in the first half of this decade; Antonio Vitorino, partner in the international law firm Gonçalves Pereira, Castelo Branco & Associados, and former Euro-

pean Union Commissioner for Justice and Home Affairs (1999–2004) and former Deputy Prime Minister of Portugal.

The Council is convened by MPI President Demetrios G. Papademetriou; its Executive Director is Gregory A. Maniatis, Senior Fellow, MPI.

Mission

The Transatlantic Council on Migration is a unique deliberative body that examines vital policy issues and informs migration policymaking processes across the Atlantic community. Its approach is evidence-based, progressive yet pragmatic, and ardently independent. Council members and their guests combine exceptional political and public influence with profound interest and experience in issues related to migration.

The Council has a dual mission:

- To help inform, and thus influence, the transatlantic immigration and integration agendas by proactively identifying critical policy issues, analyzing them in light of the best research and mature judgment, wherever they exist and bringing them to the attention of the public. In so doing, the Council's work will also build the applied, comparative, international, analytical infrastructure—a virtual and easily accessible library—that promotes better-informed policymaking on these issues.
- To serve as a resource for governments as they grapple with the challenges and opportunities associated with international migration. Council members representing governments (and other governments, as appropriate) are encouraged to bring policy initiatives to the Council so that they can be analyzed, vetted and improved before implementation—and/or evaluated after they have been executed.

This activity is carried out under the Chatham House Rule, designed to foster openness and the free exchange of information. Interested

supranational and intergovernmental institutions and processes (such as the Global Forum on International Migration and Development) will also benefit from the Council's work.

The Council's Approach

The Council's work is disseminated to capital cities through the initiative of Council members (supported by MPI and the project's Management Board), and to European institutions and the broader Brussels community through a policy partnership with the European Policy Centre and the Bertelsmann Stiftung.

The Council's work is at the cutting edge of policy analysis and evaluation, and is thus an essential tool of policymaking. Among the policy fields that the Council explores are: (a) advancing social cohesion and social justice through more thoughtful citizenship and integration policies; (b) enhancing economic growth and competitiveness through immigration; (c) encouraging and facilitating greater mobility through better security; and (d) understanding better the complex links between migration and development. The Council's work is informed by: a belief in adhering to the rule of law across the board; commitment to a rights-sensitive agenda rooted in fairness; and the determination that the increasing diversity that migration has brought about—covering virtually the entire advanced industrial world—can be managed smartly and to advantage.

The policy options placed before the Council for its deliberation are analyzed and vetted by some of the world's best specialists organized in a virtual think tank which generates, studies and evaluates practical ideas about immigration and integration policies. MPI, together with members of the Management Board and the policy partners (the Bertelsmann Stiftung and the European Policy Centre), systematically promote Council findings and decisions.

The Council is transatlantic at its very core because policymakers in Europe and North America face increasingly similar migration-related issues. As a result, policymakers find themselves coordinating

more closely in areas which, only a few years ago, were considered to be sovereign prerogatives, especially concerning mobility and security matters. They are more interested in exchanging policy ideas and good practice across the entire migration policy and practice continuum: expanding legal migration channels across skills and types (permanent, temporary, contract, project-tied, etc.) of movements; more effective integration and better relations between newcomers and established communities; and exploring the idea of forging an agenda on migration and development. Furthermore, there is a growing awareness that the actions of governments on either side of the Atlantic have implications for each other in areas such as the prevention of terrorist travel, responses to radicalization, the evolution (some say “subversion”) of the idea of citizenship and the risk that popular (but poorly reasoned) ideas of migration management will spread across the Atlantic.

The Council aims to help policymakers map the landscape with robust, analytically anchored ideas and thus inform, and even shape, the transatlantic policy agenda on migration.

The History of the Transatlantic Council on Migration

The Transatlantic Council on Migration succeeds the Transatlantic Task Force on Immigration and Integration, which was launched in the spring of 2006 by MPI and the Bertelsmann Stiftung. A full description of the Task Force, its members, publications and events is available at: www.migrationpolicy.org/transatlantic2006/.

The Task Force’s mission was to work closely with, and thus influence, the EU-wide policies advanced by the European Union presidencies of Germany and Portugal in 2007. On behalf of the Task Force, MPI served as key advisor to both presidencies and developed the substantive content for EU ministerial meetings in their entirety.

Working cooperatively with the EU Parliament and the European Commission, the Task Force placed on the EU agenda recommendations related to several critical areas, including: how citizenship poli-

cies affect integration and social cohesion; the relationship between states and emerging religious communities; the role of education in integration; and the need to re-conceptualize migration policies to improve both the economic goals of the Member States and the EU-wide development goals.

The Task Force also brought together leaders of Muslim communities, thinkers on Muslim-state relations and senior transatlantic policy officials to discuss vital differences—and find common ground—on the question of radicalization. The Task Force completed its work at the end of 2007.

The Task Force's experience has richly informed the conceptualization of the Council. The lessons learned are reflected both in the framing of the concept and its implementation—and these can be seen not only in the breadth and ambition of the effort, but also in the targeted focus of the mission statement, its broader geographic reach and its commitment to the wide dissemination of the Council's work.

The Operation of the Transatlantic Council on Migration

MPI, working closely with the Council's Management Board and its policy partners (the Bertelsmann Stiftung and the European Policy Centre), is responsible for all of the Council's work and activities. Brief dossiers are prepared that summarize and dissect potential Council issues and outline the political and policy opportunities presented by each.

The Management Board is composed of relevant MPI staff and representatives of the Council's financial supporters. It meets annually to plan the following year's work, examining and commissioning research in consultation with Council Members and key government policymakers.

The full Council meets twice annually and all meetings are held under the Chatham House Rule. Smaller preparatory and expert sessions are held prior to each meeting. The European Policy Centre

also holds two meetings per year to ensure that policymakers in Brussels are exposed to the Council's ideas. The Council plans additional satellite sessions and extraordinary meetings as warranted. Extraordinary meetings of interested Council members are convened in the capital of the country that is consulting the Council at any one time. Such meetings focus on issues of particular concern to the host country and/or are in response to an immigration crisis.

In 2008, the full Council meetings were hosted by the Rockefeller Foundation in Bellagio, Italy (April) and the Greentree Foundation in New York (November).

Attendance at each meeting is carefully constructed. Together with permanent Council members, who are the overall effort's motivating force and principal constituents, each Council meeting is enriched by the presence of senior policymakers and senior policy advisors (who are usually involved in drafting and implementing initiatives in the areas of the Council's work), and one or more top experts on the specific issue(s) on the agenda. In addition, each meeting typically includes a few select political and business leaders. Civil society and community leaders are asked to observe and address Council meetings, as appropriate. As a matter of course, the Council invites two or three senior journalists and writers to each Council session, so that they can gain more insight into migration issues and so that the Council may benefit from their experience. Any reporting that flows from their participation will strictly follow the Chatham House Rule.

Council Statement: Responding Competitively to the New Mobility of the 21st Century

Demetrios G. Papademetriou, Annette Heuser

The Transatlantic Council on Migration is a unique deliberative body that examines vital policy issues and informs migration policymaking processes across the Atlantic community. The Council takes a nonpartisan, evidence-based, pragmatic approach that is ardently independent. It has a dual mission:

1. To help inform, and thus influence, the transatlantic immigration and integration agendas by proactively identifying, analyzing and drawing out the policy essence of critical issues and bringing them to public attention.
2. To serve as an idea factory and resource for governments as they grapple with the challenges and opportunities associated with international migration.

Council Members and Council guests combine exceptional political, policy and public influence with profound interest, experience and expertise in issues related to migration. Each year, the Council holds two meetings to examine a key aspect of international migration. The meetings are supported by commissioned research and policy analysis, supplemented by presentations by leading experts from around the world.

The Council releases a statement twice a year. Each statement is the result of a series of judgments made by the Council, informed both by the commissioned research and the Council's discussions. The purpose of each Transatlantic Council Statement is to present a series of insights and evidence-based options to a senior political and policy audience.

The Council Statement is the sole responsibility of the Migration Policy Institute and its policy partners, the Bertelsmann Stiftung and the European Policy Centre. It reflects the discussions of the Council but final responsibility for content rests with the authors.

This is the Council's second Statement, developed from the deliberations held in November 2008 when the Council met in New York to discuss the theme "Economic Competitiveness and International Migration."

Migration in an Economic Downturn

The global recession's deepening effects on governments, public and private institutions and individuals will increasingly take center stage for those who examine and shape migration policy, the protagonists in the process, and those who are affected by it—whether at source or destination countries. But while the depth of the economic downturn is not knowable at this time, there is little doubt that it continues to spread and 2009 is shaping up as a year when the global economy retreats. The social consequences of this retreat will be felt by all. They will be felt most severely, however, by poor people everywhere, a reality that has implications for the hundreds of millions who rely on immigrants and immigration for their survival.

The economic contraction will, of course, not affect all countries to the same degree nor will every economic sector within each country suffer equally. For instance, health services across the board and elderly services of all sorts will continue to show strong demand for workers, while the least desirable and many seasonal jobs will continue to be "essential" jobs yet still shunned by many native workers. Similarly, not every worker within even the sectors most affected by the recession will experience the poor economy the same way. Solid social protection systems, early and smart policy interventions, the skills and education individual workers possess, and, often enough, a worker's immigration status (how recent, under what visa category, legal status, etc.), will modulate the downturn's effect on individuals

and families. And while there is very little useful historical experience to guide the analysis, the accumulating evidence and informed speculation point to the following preliminary judgments:

- Immigrants are among the most vulnerable actors in a recession and are likely to be hit first and hardest (largely because they are more heavily concentrated in job sectors that are affected significantly and early in an economic downturn, have lower skills and education on average and have less experience in the host country's labor market).
- Flows of unauthorized migrants, contract and otherwise temporary (but not seasonal) workers and students will be most directly affected; family and humanitarian flows the least affected.
- Informal economies are likely to grow, and consequently the exploitation of immigrants.
- As economic conditions deteriorate, perceptions of immigrants will likely become more negative as foreigners are perceived to take jobs, lower wages and consume scarce resources, primarily in the form of social housing and other welfare benefits. In extreme cases, social unrest may follow.

Given these potential outcomes, the Council believes it is especially important to take the following into account:

1. Investments in immigrant integration policies and programs must continue apace as should proactive policies that emphasize common aims and invest public resources without regard to ethnicity or immigration status (other than legal status). Such initiatives are also essential if societies are to prevent social divisions from getting out of hand and are to emerge stronger once the recession is over.
2. Governments will come under pressure to reduce immigration flows. However, while temporary restrictions might offer certain benefits, governments must be particularly wise (working with the market and human nature and relying more on incentives and less on state power) if they are not to have adverse effects—especially in the mid- and longer term, as economies seek to recover. The well-

documented flexibility of many migrants in the labor market—their willingness to move geographically and across job categories and economic sectors—can be a significant factor in plugging some of the inevitable supply gaps for certain jobs during the downturn while helping with the economic recovery and future growth upon the recession's end, and thus should not be ignored. The global economic contraction has not put a pause on the competitive pressures unleashed in an ever more globalized world, making it still important for countries to attract the migrants that build their supply of human capital and match their labor market needs.

Competing for Talent

Globalization makes economic competitiveness job number one as much for firms as for national policymakers. While competitiveness is primarily, even overwhelmingly, dependent on a complex set of policies that grow and nurture first-rate national workforces (ranging from effective educational and workforce development systems and social and cultural environments that support lifelong learning, to great universities and smart public and private sector investments in R&D), international migration policies can also play a crucial support role. This realization motivates a growing global hunt for talent and is changing how countries formulate economic/labor market-focused immigration policies.

The emerging competition, however, need not be a zero-sum game. There is a vast array of talent on offer, and receiving countries have distinct competitive advantages that they can, and do, exploit more or less systematically. (The United States has long enjoyed a seemingly insurmountable lead in attracting the most talented and energetic foreigners but several other countries seem intent on closing this “preference gap.”) At the same time, and with concepts of skill being constantly refined (soft, hard, specific and also unique), countries that rely on their bureaucracies to “choose” the skilled immigrants to be admitted (increasing numbers of countries allow

their employers to make these decisions or share the responsibility with them) can begin to fine-tune their selection criteria and make them conform more closely to their economies' needs.

Nor does the developed world have a lock on attracting the most creative, entrepreneurial and innovative individuals. Skilled immigrants already head to countries such as China and India and more are likely to do so in the future. This will be so particularly as the economies of these countries, as well as the labor needs of many emerging and middle-income economies (such as those of Brazil, Russia, Mexico, South Africa, etc.) for skilled immigrants grow and the world's demographic picture continues to evolve.

Demographic and Human Capital Futures

Demographic change is reshaping societies and economies across the developed and developing worlds and provides a key element in the policy narrative of any discussion of migration and economic competitiveness.

We live in a demographically divided world: the populations of high- and some middle-income regions are aging and some countries within these regions are in fact beginning to shrink, while those of most middle- and lower-income countries continue to grow fast. The two demographic "billionaires," India and China, although on sharply different demographic trajectories, will likely continue their expansion for another generation before stabilizing. The expected peak of the "youth bulge" in much of Asia means that in 2030 the region will hold half of the world's 15–34 year-old population.

Eastern Europe and Africa epitomize this disparity. Eastern Europe will first grow older and shrink, and then stabilize (in the region of 60 million people by 2100). Africa, by contrast, will continue to grow rapidly; mindful of the dangers of projecting far into the future, the median forecast is that the continent's population will quadruple to two billion by 2100. While demographic change unfolds over decades, immigration is the visible surf on the waves of such change.

However, predicting the flow of people across borders is even more inexact. Some facts, nonetheless, make for compelling food for thought. For example, in less than a generation, Africa could be home to more PhDs than the European Union if the continent's school enrollment keeps pace with population growth. And the need for "survival emigration," that is, emigration by those who have no economic opportunity or feel that they must emigrate to support their families, will continue to be very large for extended periods of time almost regardless of how well economic growth and social renewal take hold.

Similarly, social changes already in evidence point to increased mobility in some parts of that continent. In the Middle East and North Africa (MENA) region, young adults are now better educated, women have more opportunities and both genders already have fewer family obligations that would keep them at home. Together, such trends amount to a "push factor" that will ensure that the dynamic of more emigration from the MENA region will continue well into the future and, like with some of the projections from the rest of Africa, can provide opportunities for labor-short Europe.

In sum, demography suggests an obvious, if socially and culturally still difficult, synergy between the developing and developed worlds, with continued high immigration into the latter.

Governments will thus be expected to exercise caution in reaching out to immigration as a central answer to demographic change—but, nonetheless, immigration will be a larger part of that answer than some policymakers may now expect. The most policy savvy among those policymakers will consider openings to more immigration in combination with other policy responses. Among them must be adjustments to pension schemes, longer working lives, school reforms and smarter investments in education and workforce development programs, and sustained efforts to expand the labor market participation rates for those who lag behind. Still, there are other reasons for seeking immigrants, not least to tap the talents of the most well-prepared and dynamic people wherever they happen to be.

Policy Principles: Positioning Policies for Economic Migration

Economic migration is just one part of an immigration system, alongside others, such as humanitarian protection migration and family (re)unification. Every immigration system must balance differing policy priorities and legal responsibilities. Economic migration policies are thus part of a wider picture, just like the fact that people migrate for different reasons, and represent one element of rapidly changing labor markets.

The most successful immigration policies will be those that are designed in tandem with—rather than in isolation from—other policies that shape economies and labor markets, including education policy, training and social welfare.

In a globalized world, technology, capital and, increasingly, talent recognize neither borders nor nationality. Already today, but even more so in the future, talent and initiative are considered to be most valuable resources. Immigration systems are responding by recognizing the special place that these attributes play in economic competitiveness and accommodating the entry of those who hold them and, in many instances, giving migrants and employers a stronger role in determining the shape of the emerging migration flows. In the years ahead, economic migration policies will need to take even better account of the goals and intentions of businesses, communities and migrants in order to effectively attract, utilize and maintain the skills that will most benefit individual countries.

Recommendations

Countries seeking to attract talent need to do a better job of identifying workers with the right potential and skills. This requires a new framework for policymaking and the ongoing re-tuning of existing economic and labor migration policies.

Migration systems need to become more flexible and responsive to labor market and economic conditions. “Hybrid” systems will prove

most effective in this respect: government-centered approaches, such as points systems, can help nations accumulate human capital, while employer-led programs, such as work permits or employment visas, can fill labor shortages most effectively and make firms more competitive. The clearest lesson the Council draws from the studies prepared for it and its own discussions is that both types of systems serve important purposes and should be relied upon.

Such systems should:

- Avoid a “just-in-time” approach to policymaking. Instead, they should incorporate forward planning for the labor market (as far as is possible), while also priming the education and training pipeline that will always be central to a country’s international competitiveness.
- Employ different mechanisms and channels of entry to maximize value.
- Experiment, monitor, evaluate and regularly modify policies to ensure that changing needs can be more easily met, and failing policies can be identified at the earliest possible time and abandoned.

Part II:

Piecing together the Global Demographic Puzzle