

*Blackwell
Companions to
Philosophy*

A COMPANION TO THE PHILOSOPHY OF HISTORY AND HISTORIOGRAPHY



Edited by
AVIEZER TUCKER

Contents

List of Contributors

Acknowledgments

Glossary of Terms

1 Introduction

Part I Major Fields

2 Philosophy of Historiography

Facts

Evidence

**The Structure of Description and
Justification**

Explanation and Understanding

Summary

3 Philosophy of History

The Term “Philosophy of History”

The Terms “Philosophy” and “History”

Historiographical Production

Critical Theory of Historiography vs.

Substantive Philosophy of History

The Meaning and Function of History

**The Evolution of Substantive Philosophies
of History**

The Poetics of the Substantive Philosophy of History

The Arrival of the Philosophy of Historiography

4 Philosophical Issues in Natural History and Its Historiography

Introduction

The Scientific Method of Yore

The Structure and Research Practices of Scientific Historiography of Nature

Explanation and Confirmation in Scientific Historiography

Narrative Explanation

Common Cause Explanation

5 Historians and Philosophy of Historiography

JOHN ZAMMITO

A Perennial Crisis? When “Historiography” Faces “Philosophy”

The Poststructuralist/Postmodernist Challenge

Practicing Historians and the Challenge of Philosophy

Concluding Comment

Part II Basic Problems

6 Historiographic Evidence and Confirmation

What Is Historiographic Evidence?

Bayesianism

Bayesianism as a Model of Historiographic Reasoning

Explanationism

Towards an Explanationist Bayesianism

Applications: Skepticism

Applications: Underdetermination

7 Causation in Historiography

Unificationist Accounts of Causation

Conditional Theories

Counterfactuals

Causation as a Process

Probability

Exceptionalism

Eliminativism

Primitivism

8 Historiographic Counterfactuals

The Counterfactual Character of Historiography

Understanding

Metaphysical Preliminaries

Causal Counterfactual Analysis in Historiography

Counterfactuals and Practical Reasoning

Science and Counterfactuals

9 Historical Necessity and Contingency

Introduction

Necessity and Contingency as Degrees of Stability

Necessity (Contingency) and Description

Cleopatra's Nose and Other Category Mistakes

Making a Difference

Emplotment

Prophets of Contingency

10 Explanation in Historiography

1

2

3

Acknowledgment

11 Historiographic Understanding *GIUSEPPINA D'ORO*

Introduction

The Argument for Methodological Unity

The Argument against Methodological Unity

Understanding Others

The Ontological Turn and the New Causalist Consensus

12 Colligation

The Concept of “Colligation”

Some Common Hazards in Colligation

Philosophical Issues

Colligation and Postmodernism

The Value of Colligation

13 The Laws of History

A Systematic Look at Laws in History and Nature

The History of the “Laws of History”

Current Problems and Debates in History and Neighboring Disciplines

14 Historiographic Objectivity

Objectivity and Methodology

Relativism and Beyond

Scientific Historiography

Approximating the Truth about History

Conclusion

15 Realism about the Past

Commonsense Realism

Representative Realism

Analytic Realism

Materialism

Anti-realism

16 Anti-realism about the Past

Realism vs. Anti-realism in the Semantics of Mathematical Language

Anti-realism about the Empirical Realm and, in Particular, about the Past

Historical Significance and Historical Insignificance

Generality and Holistic Explanations

The Objectivity of Historiography

Conclusion

17 Narrative and Interpretation

Introduction

Origins of the Contemporary Debate

Historiographic Research and Writing

Two Variants of Narrativist Philosophy of Historiography

The Philosophical Approach

The Transcendentalization of Narrativist

Philosophy of Historiography

Rhetorical Narrativist Philosophy

Hayden White

Conclusion

18 The Ontology of the Objects of Historiography

Background

Methodological Individualism

Problems with Methodological Individualism

The Nature of Social Reality

[Conclusion](#)
[Bibliography](#)

[19 Origins: Common Causes in Historiographic Reasoning](#)

[Some Common Cause vs. a Particular common Cause](#)

[Type vs. Token Common Cause](#)

[Information Preservation and the Inference of the Existence of Some Common Causes](#)

[The Meaning of the Existence of Some Common Cause](#)

[Likelihoods of the Variational Group given Common and Separate Causes](#)

[Alternative Common Cause Hypotheses](#)

[20 Phylogenetic Inference](#)

[Introduction](#)

[From Art to Science: An Introduction to Schools of Thought](#)

[How to Infer Phylogeny, Or, Why Some Cladists Aren't "Cladists"](#)

[Summary and Synthesis](#)

[Acknowledgment](#)

[21 Historicism](#)

[Historiographic Concepts](#)

[Historical Laws](#)

[Historiographic Interpretations](#)

Conclusion

22 Ethics and the Writing of Historiography

23 Logical Fallacies of Historians

Types of Fallacy

Logical Fallacies of Historians

Fallacies and Historians

24 Historical Fallacies of Historians

Philosophers' fallacies and historians' fallacies

Five Historical Fallacies

Historical Fallacies of Philosophers and the Relationship of Philosophy to its History

Part III Philosophy and Sub-fields of Historiography

25 Philosophy of History of Science

Introduction

Critical Narratives

Rival Reconstructions

Philosophical Problems

26 Philosophies of Historiography and the Social Sciences

An Intellectual Historiography
Why and When Historiography Needs Social Theory
Why and When Does Social Theory Needs Historiography?
Conclusion

27 The Philosophy of Evolutionary Theory

Progress and Evolution
Embryological Analogies
Charles Darwin's Theory of Evolution
After Darwin
The Twentieth Century
Growing Up

28 The Philosophy of Geology

Introduction
Identifying Unique Events
Representing Events
Unique Events and Explanation in Scientific Historiography
Illustration of Evidence and Events
Conclusion

29 Philosophy of Archaeology

The Interpretive Dilemma
Archaeology and Philosophy
Middle Range Theory

The Science of Archaeology
Where Do Hypotheses Come From?
Cognitive Archaeology and the Archaeology of Cognition
Darwinian and Biological Archaeology
Environmental Archaeology
Archaeology as Social Science

30 Reductionism: Historiography and Psychology

1
2
3
4
5

Acknowledgment

31 Historiography and Myth

Some Basic Definitions
Historiography and Myth in Ancient Greece
Mythical Historiography in Antiquity
Myth vs. Historiography

32 Historiography and Memory

33 Historiographic Schools

The Concept of "Schools"
Main Schools of Historiography

*Towards a Theory of the History of
Historiography*

**Part IV Classical Schools and
Philosophers of Historiography
and History.**

34 Leopold Ranke

Scientific Historiography
Substantive Assumptions
The Meaning of History

35 Scientific Historiography

Theory and Method in Historiography:
Some Preliminary Distinctions
A Short History of the Historiographic
Method
Critical Method and Its Discontents
The Comparative Method as the “Royal
Road” to Scientific Historiography?

36 Darwin

Progress and the Tree of History
Discovering the Past
Teleological Thinking

**37 Logical Empiricism and Logical
Positivism**

[*Logical Positivism: Basic Information*](#)
[*The Hempelian Model of Explanation in Historiography*](#)
[*Popperian Critique of Historicism*](#)
[*Conclusion*](#)

[*38 Jewish and Christian Philosophy of History*](#)

[*Biblical Foundations*](#)
[*Post-biblical Variations*](#)
[*Modern Legacies*](#)

[*39 Muslim Philosophy of History*](#)

[*Introduction*](#)
[*Muslim or Islamic Philosophy of History?*](#)
[*Islamic Concept of History*](#)
[*Development of Muslim Philosophy of History and Historiography*](#)
[*Two Muslim Philosophers of History: Ibn Miskawayh and Ibn Khaldun*](#)
[*Muslim Philosophy of History and Encounters with the West*](#)
[*Conclusion*](#)

[*40 Vico*](#)

[*Theological Convictions*](#)
[*Philosophical Assumptions*](#)
[*Philological Interpretations*](#)
[*Historiographical Implications*](#)

41 Kant and Herder

Kant's Philosophy of History

Criticisms of Kant's Philosophy of History

Herder's Reflections and His Objections to Kant's Philosophy of History

Criticisms of Herder's Philosophy of History

42 Hegel

Hegel's Interest in History and the French Revolution

Hegel and the Philosophy of History

Hegel and the History of Philosophy

Hegel's Historical Approach to Knowledge

43 Neo-Kantianism

The Setting and Development of Neo-Kantian Thought

Windelband's Division of the Sciences: Nomothetic and Idiographic

Heinrich Rickert's Theory of Historical Knowledge

Cassirer's Logic of the Cultural Sciences

44 Marx

On the Marxist Reading of Marx's Philosophy of History

Marx's Philosophy of History

Marx on History and Freedom

Marx's Historical Approach to Cognition

45 Collingwood and Croce

Philosophical Context

Knowing History

The Content of History and Historiography

Conclusion

46 Phenomenology

Husserl's Phenomenology

Phenomenology and History

Heidegger

Later Developments in Phenomenology

Prospects for a Phenomenological

Philosophy of History

47 Jan Patočka

48 Hermeneutics

49 Postmodernism

Postmodernism's Challenge

Responses to the Postmodern Challenge

Continuing Crisis of Incompatibilities

Conclusion

50 Philosophy of History at the End of the Cold War

The Recovery of the Philosophy of History

The End of History: Hegel Redivivus

***The Clash of Civilizations: The Revenge of
the Past?***

Index

Blackwell Companions to Philosophy

This outstanding student reference series offers a comprehensive and authoritative survey of philosophy as a whole. Written by today's leading philosophers, each volume provides lucid and engaging coverage of the key figures, terms, topics, and problems of the field. Taken together, the volumes provide the ideal basis for course use, representing an unparalleled work of reference for students and specialists alike.

Already published in the series:

1. The Blackwell Companion to Philosophy, Second Edition
Edited by Nicholas Bunnin and Eric Tsui-James
2. A Companion to Ethics
Edited by Peter Singer
3. A Companion to Aesthetics
Edited David Cooper
4. A Companion to Epistemology
Edited by Jonathan Dancy and Ernest Sosa
5. A Companion to Contemporary Political Philosophy (two-volume set), Second Edition
Edited by Robert E. Goodin and Philip Pettit
6. A Companion to Philosophy of Mind
Edited by Samuel Guttenplan
7. A Companion to Metaphysics
Edited by Jaegwon Kim and Ernest Sosa
8. A Companion to Philosophy of Law and Legal Theory
Edited by Dennis Patterson
9. A Companion to Philosophy of Religion
Edited by Philip L. Quinn and Charles Taliaferro
10. A Companion to the Philosophy of Language
Edited by Bob Hale and Crispin Wright

11. A Companion to World Philosophies
Edited by Eliot Deutsch and Ron Bontekoe
12. A Companion to Continental Philosophy
Edited by Simon Critchley and William Schroeder
13. A Companion to Feminist Philosophy
Edited by Alison M. Jaggar and Iris Marion Young
14. A Companion to Cognitive Science
Edited by William Bechtel and George Graham
15. A Companion to Bioethics
Edited by Helga Kuhse and Peter Singer
16. A Companion to the Philosophers
Edited by Robert L. Arrington
17. A Companion to Business Ethics
Edited by Robert E. Frederick
18. A Companion to the Philosophy of Science
Edited by W. H. Newton-Smith
19. A Companion to Environmental Philosophy
Edited by Dale Jamieson
20. A Companion to Analytic Philosophy
Edited by A. P. Martinich and David Sosa
21. A Companion to Genethics
Edited by Justine Burley and John Harris
22. A Companion to Philosophical Logic
Edited by Dale Jacquette
23. A Companion to Early Modern Philosophy
Edited by Steven Nadler
24. A Companion to Philosophy in the Middle Ages
Edited by Jorge J. E. Gracia and Timothy B. Noone
25. A Companion to African-American Philosophy
Edited by Tommy L. Lott and John P. Pittman
26. A Companion to Applied Ethics
Edited by R. G. Frey and Christopher Heath Wellman
27. A Companion to the Philosophy of Education
Edited by Randall Curren

28. A Companion to African Philosophy
Edited by Kwasi Wiredu
29. A Companion to Heidegger
Edited by Hubert L. Dreyfus and Mark A. Wrathall
30. A Companion to Rationalism
Edited by Alan Nelson
31. A Companion to Ancient Philosophy
Edited by Mary Louise Gill and Pierre Pellegrin
32. A Companion to Pragmatism
Edited by John R. Shook and Joseph Margolis
33. A Companion to Nietzsche
Edited by Keith Ansell Pearson
34. A Companion to Socrates
Edited by Sara Ahbel-Rappe and Rachana Kamtekar
35. A Companion to Phenomenology and Existentialism
Edited by Hubert L. Dreyfus and Mark A. Wrathall
36. A Companion to Kant
Edited by Graham Bird
37. A Companion to Plato
Edited by Hugh H. Benson
38. A Companion to Descartes
Edited by Janet Broughton and John Carriero
39. A Companion to the Philosophy of Biology
Edited by Sahotra Sarkar and Anya Plutynski
40. A Companion to Hume
Edited by Elizabeth S. Radcliffe
41. A Companion to the Philosophy of History and Historiography
Edited by Aviezer Tucker

Forthcoming

42. A Companion to Aristotle
Edited by Georgios Anagnostopoulos

Also under contract:

A Companion to Philosophy of Literature, Edited by Jost and Hagberg

A Companion to Schopenhauer, Edited by Bart Vandenabeele

A Companion to the Philosophy of Technology, Edited by Jan-Kyrre Berg Olsen, Stig Andur Pedersen and Vincent F. Hendricks

A Companion to the Philosophy of History and Historiography

Edited by
Aviezer Tucker



This edition first published 2009
© 2009 Blackwell Publishing Ltd

Blackwell Publishing was acquired by John Wiley & Sons in February 2007. Blackwell's publishing program has been merged with Wiley's global Scientific, Technical, and Medical business to form Wiley-Blackwell.

Registered office

John Wiley & Sons Ltd, The Atrium, Southern Gate,
Chichester, West Sussex, PO19 8SQ, United Kingdom

Editorial Offices

350 Main Street, Malden, MA 02148-5020, USA
9600 Garsington Road, Oxford, OX4 2DQ, UK
The Atrium, Southern Gate, Chichester, West Sussex, PO19
8SQ, UK

For details of our global editorial offices, for customer services, and for information about how to apply for permission to reuse the copyright material in this book please see our website at www.wiley.com/wiley-blackwell.

The right of Aviezer Tucker to be identified as the author of the editorial material in this work has been asserted in accordance with the Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988.

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted, in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, except as permitted by the UK Copyright, Designs and Patents Act 1988, without the prior permission of the publisher.

Wiley also publishes its books in a variety of electronic formats. Some content that appears in print may not be available in electronic books.

Designations used by companies to distinguish their products are often claimed as trademarks. All brand names

and product names used in this book are trade names, service marks, trademarks or registered trademarks of their respective owners. The publisher is not associated with any product or vendor mentioned in this book. This publication is designed to provide accurate and authoritative information in regard to the subject matter covered. It is sold on the understanding that the publisher is not engaged in rendering professional services. If professional advice or other expert assistance is required, the services of a competent professional should be sought.

Library of Congress Cataloging-in-Publication Data

A companion to the philosophy of history and historiography
/ edited by Aviezer Tucker.

p. cm. – (Blackwell companions to philosophy ; 41)

Includes bibliographical references and index.

ISBN 978-1-4051-4908-2 (hbk. : alk. paper)

1. Historiography–Philosophy. 2. History–Philosophy. I.
Tucker, Aviezer, 1965–

D13.C627 2008

907.2–dc22

2008007601

A catalogue record for this title is available from the British
Library.

01 2009

Contributors

Zaid Ahmad, Universiti Putra, Malaysia

Sharon Anderson-Gold, Rensselaer Polytechnic Institute

F. R. Ankersmit, University of Groningen, The Netherlands

Charles Bambach, University of Dallas, Texas

Yemima Ben-Menahem, Hebrew University

Stephan Berry, Berlin

Krzysztof Brzechczyn, Adam Mickiewicz
University/Institute of National Remembrance, Poland

Ivan Chvatik, Czech Academy of Science

Carol E. Cleland, University of Colorado, Boulder

Robert D'Amico, University of Florida

Mark Day, Nottingham-Trent University

Giuseppina D'Oro, Keele University

Thomas Gil, Technical University of Berlin

Jonathan Gorman, Queen's University, Belfast

Matt Haber, University of Utah

Stein Helgeby, Melbourne, Australia

Rob Inkpen, University of Portsmouth

Nicholas Jardine, University of Cambridge

Ben Jeffares, Australia National University

Harold Kincaid, University of Alabama, Birmingham

Colin G. King, Humboldt University of Berlin

Peter Kosso, Northern Arizona University

Krishnan Kumar, University of Virginia

Claire Lavabre, CNRS, France

Mary Lefkowitz, Wellesley College

Christopher Lloyd, University of New England

Chris Lorenz, VU University of Amsterdam

Cynthia Macdonald, Queen's University, Belfast

Graham Macdonald, University of Canterbury, New
Zealand

Rudolf A. Makkreel, Emory University
Joseph Mali, Tel Aviv University, Israel
C. Behan McCullagh, La Trobe University
Samuel Moyn, Columbia University
Murray Murphey, University of Pennsylvania
Paul Newall, British Royal Navy
Fabrice Pataut, Institut d'Histoire et de Philosophie des
Sciences et des Techniques, Paris
Gregory Radick, University of Leeds
Tom Rockmore, Duquesne University
Michael Ruse, Florida State University
Beverley Southgate, University of Hertfordshire
Carlos Spoerhase, Humboldt University of Berlin
Aviezer Tucker, Prague
Lars Udehn, Stockholm University
Zdeněk Vašíček, Institute for Contemporary History,
Prague
David Weberman, Central European University, Hungary
Elazar Weinryb, Open University of Israel
John S. Wilkins, University of Queensland, Australia
John Zammito, Rice University

Acknowledgments

I wish to thank first and foremost the contributors to this Companion. This excellent group of scholars, from four continents, are typical of the heterogeneity, sophistication, and charm of philosophers of historiography and history. In addition to being at the top of their respective philosophic fields, the authors make significant contributions to a dozen different academic areas, as well as excelling in other activities; in addition to academics, the contributors include novelists, a naval officer, independent scholars, and former dissidents. As the opera is only truly over when the fat lady sings, a Companion is complete only when the last contributor hands in the final essay. Therefore, I wish to thank, in particular, those contributors who obligingly stepped in at short notice to fill in and author a second entry, when that slot became unexpectedly vacant, so that we were able to complete the Companion in a timely fashion: Paul Newall, Tom Rockmore, and especially, Graham Macdonald. I can hardly imagine what they must have had to go through! I should like to thank Jeff Dean, the philosophy editor at Blackwell, for working with me on this project for the last three years, since I proposed the Companion while I was an Australia Research Fellow at the Australian National University in Canberra. At the ANU I was inspired by Robert Goodin, who co-edited Blackwell's *Companion to Contemporary Political Philosophy*, and with whom I conducted research there. I did most of the editorial work while I was working at Queen's University, Belfast. I benefited from the steady support of Jonathan Gorman, who also contributed an entry to this companion. Graeme Leonard meticulously copy-edited the volume.

This Companion has lived with me for three years and has thus become quite a member of the family. As it is about to mature, leave home, and hopefully carve a niche for itself on the shelves of the big wide world out there, it makes

room for yet another companion to join myself and my companion for life, Veronika, who has stood by me through each one of my books, knowing it would never be the last. As for that other life-long companion, in the words of a poet of my generation:

Still in the earliest days of history When the world existed
only in theory . . .

Aviezer Tucker,
Bangor, Co. Down,
April 2008

Glossary of Terms

Historians People who write about past events. For example, Leopold Ranke.

Historical Of past events. For example, Latin was the historical language of the Romans.

Historiographers People who write about the history of historiography. For example, Georg Iggers.

Historiographic Of historiography, of written accounts of past events. For example, the theoretical assumptions historians make.

Historiographic narrative The final result of historiographic research written in narrative form. For example, textbooks.

Historiographic research The professional activities of historians. For example, searching the archives.

Historiography What historians write, about past events, about history. For example, Leopold Ranke's *History of the Popes*.

History Past events, processes, etc. For example, the decline and fall of the Roman Empire.

Natural historians or historians of nature People who write about natural history. For example, Stephen J. Gould.

Natural historiography or historiography of nature Writings about natural history by natural historians. For example, Stephen Hawking's *A Brief History of Time*.

Natural history The history of non-humans. For example, the universe, planet earth, the species.

Philosophy of historiography The philosophical examination, study, and theorizing about historiography, about what historians write, and its relation to the evidence, the epistemology of historiography, the ontology of historiographic concepts, etc.

Philosophy of history Philosophical examination, study, and theorizing about the past, including

substantial/speculative philosophy of history but also issues like contingency and necessity in history. For example, Hegel's *Philosophy of History*.

Scientific historiography Historiography that offers scientific-grade probable beliefs about history.